

# City of Hendersonville Buy-Recycled Report

May 30, 2001

## 1. Description of the project's accomplishments:

- Educational component – good workshop
- Forming a team for the project created buy-in
- The team shared research information well
- The audit made the team aware of the things they were recycling already and the recycled content products they were already buying to close the loop. This made them feel good about themselves and what their departments were doing
- The audit gave us a format to discuss and familiarize ourselves with the terminology, and objectives (to do more than what is currently being done to buy recycled products).
- A trust in the quality of recycled content products was reestablished
- Everyone had recycling back on his or her “radar screen.” Whereas before the project, not much thought was given to it.
- A formal Policy looks promising for adoption
- The Procurement Team is willing to continue to implement the policy, and a tracking plan is being established.

## 2. Assessment of adherence to the contract Scope of Work:

The Buy Recycled Project for the City of Hendersonville was completed as determined by the workplan and timeline. See as attachment: *City of Hendersonville Buy-Recycled Work Plan*. The research period for acquiring and evaluating the products took longer than the timeline suggested. In fact, the long term evaluations for the manhole risers was not possible within the timeframe of the grant project

## 3. Evaluation of success (i.e. Did the project meet its goals?):

The Buy-Recycled project was a definite success. It met all of the goals and objectives of the grant proposal: The project 1) conducted a training workshop for education of department heads and city staff; 2) formulated a procurement team; 3) conducted an audit of current products being used and their content; 4) researched the acquisition of products with more recycled content; 5) evaluated the quality and performance of the new products; 6) developed a formal new policy, with procurement guidelines, for buying recycled content products; 7) presented to City Council a buy-recycled policy for approval and adoption; 8) secured buy-in of implementation plan with lead purchasing officers.

## 4. Description of unanticipated events (negative and positive) in conducting the project.

A few unexpected events occurred during the project. For example, the past negative experiences that the people on the Procurement Team had had with recycled products gave an upfront negative attitude toward giving recycled products another try. With encouragement and persistence, this was overcome.

Any increase in the cost of items made the Team hesitant to buy recycled. However, when some products were located that actually cost less, it gave the Team a positive boost to go on.

As mentioned later in the report (see Procurement Research – Office Supplies), a copy machine repairman, with twenty years of experience, visited a team meeting. He said: “Keep trying different kinds of recycled paper until you get one that works for your machines.” This pep-talk gave the team an attitude adjustment – don’t give up on trying recycled paper.

Early in the project arrangements were made to recycle a truckload of misprinted water bills. A truck was loaded and driven to Asheville Waste Paper, but no payment was made. The driver expected to receive \$.03-.04 per pound for the paper. On arrival, he was told that the paper in the truck was not the kind they would pay for. The driver dumped the load and returned to Hendersonville.

**5. Description of what you would do differently if you could do the project over again.**

The project met with success due to its educational component, careful planning, buy-in from the participants, and vigilance in communication. I can't think of anything we could have done differently to improve the outcome.

**6. Description of program. Discuss how this project will influence purchasing decisions in the future.**

**Procurement Team Formed**

The project was initiated by inviting a group of employees of the City of Hendersonville who were most involved in purchasing for their departments, to come together to form a team for the Buy-Recycled project. The Procurement Team met on Oct. 5. to get an overview of the project. The general results of the meeting were positive; however, some of the members had had poor results from using recycled products in the past.

They were asked go back to their department to do an audit of the products they bought last year (July 1,1999 – June30, 2000) to see if what they were currently using had any recycled content. This would form a basis from which to show increases in recycled content purchases. They were also asked to record what materials from their departments they currently recycled instead of throw away. This step gave the team a chance to do a good assessment of the recycling in their departments, and an understanding of the lack of closed loop recycling in a real physical hands-on way. An unexpected result was the pride each department felt in what they already were doing in regards to recycling. They understood that what we were asking them to do was incorporate the next steps of recycling into their current efforts.

**Procurement Team members:**

Chris Carter	City Manager
Tammie Drake	City Clerk
Don Sides	Director, Public Works
Freddie Hoots	Motor Pool
Bari Souther	Public Works
Dan Summey	Police Department
Marge Galloway	Finance Dept.
Sharon Walker	Field Operations
Micky Robinson	Engineering, Water & Sewer Dept.

**Workshop**

A 2-hour workshop on recycling was planned for City department heads and staff. The workshop was held on October 20 at Toms Park recreation center. Invitations were extended to 4 other government entities within Henderson County, the Henderson County School System, Blue Ridge Community College, and Pardee Hospital. (See attached letter of invitation)

Katie Breckheimer, a local environmental educator, presented the workshop. Linda Nash from the Land of Sky Regional Council assisted her. The presentation included an icebreaker "history of recycling;" a 12-minute video from Keep America Beautiful, *Close the Loop. Buy recycled*; an overview of local recycling which included city, county, and regional recycling; an overview of the economics of recycling on

a national and international level; options for where to look for recycled products; a discussion of cost and quality concerns; and a large hands-on display of things made from recycled materials. Catalogues, info-packets, and free samples were distributed.

The workshop was well attended by the Procurement Team as well as a few other City staffers and representatives from the other invited institutions. In all, approximately 15 people participated in the workshop, and it received positive feedback. (See enclosed workshop agenda and flyer)

## **The Audit Results**

The Procurement Team met on November 3 to discuss the results of their department's inventories and to review the categories the grant would be using for buying in the next phase of the project. See the reports from each department in the attachments.

## **Procurement Research**

### Automotive

Initially the Department was hesitant to use reprocessed products in their work. They remembered from earlier trials that they were not satisfied, the products seemed inferior. More oil changes were required than with the virgin equivalent. They also noted having to use a barrel of the oil product, which was too inconvenient and messy. They would need quarts or five-gallon containers, if they were going to use it.

Both the consultant and the Public Works Department researched re-refined motor oil and found that most of the reprocessed oil products on the market are in the far corners of the earth. California, Canada, and England. At the time of the grant cycle, even the state contract office was having trouble locating a source. Safety Kleen Inc. in Greer, SC, was finally located as a distributor of "America's Choice" motor oil. The sales rep was to send 2 cases for our trial, but it never happened. Many phone calls were made. The Public Works Dept. seemed to think Safety Kleen wanted the entire recycling program for the city motorpool garage, and were not willing to dabble in selling just a little oil to us. The City already had a local company collecting their waste products such as parts cleaner, waste oil and antifreeze. They did not want to switch to Safety Kleen for the entire contract.

By the end of the research period the motorpool representative seemed open and willing to buy the re-refined oil as soon as some was located. The Warren Oil products, newly offered on state contract, have been discussed and should be purchased in the near future. In trying to acquire re-refined motor oil during the grant period, the team felt they had tried their best, but no results were forthcoming.

### Landscaping

The Public Works Department agreed to use Permamats, a tree mulch pad made from recycled tires. The mats were installed in a new city park that had new trees planted in it.

Tire chip mulch was researched for use in city playgrounds (under swing sets and playground equipment). The Public Works Director found a source of the mulch, but the minimum amount and the delivery charge made the purchase price prohibitive.

A seeding system that incorporated recycled newspapers in a seed/fiber slurry was given a trial run. It met with success and the Public Works Director said he would rent the system again when seeding a large area.

The Department said they would also consider buying recycled plastic benches, fencing, and parking bumpers the next time these items were needed.

## Office Supplies

Multipurpose office paper was located for purchase. The City paper purchaser was very skeptical of buying recycled paper. In fact, he reported that the operations manual for the Cannon Copier in the engineering department, specifically says not to use recycled paper in it. So we decided to try 30% post consumer recycled paper for research and evaluation as a first step. Fifteen cases were ordered and distributed with evaluation forms to several departments. The first evaluation forms showed mixed reviews. The downstairs copy machine at City Hall was constantly jamming with the recycled paper. One morning during a Procurement Team meeting the copy machine repairman, who happened to be there working on the troubled copier, was asked his opinion of recycled paper. He spoke to the team about his 20 year work experience working for Xerox. He said that paper is highly variable, and if one recycled paper doesn't work in your machine, don't give up, try another kind! Most of the evaluations that came back for the Great White paper we tried came back positive. It was determined that the copy machine at City Hall did best with very dry paper, so paper were subsequently stored differently for better results. Another source of recycled paper was located Mac Paper Distributors who carry 30%pc Champion Paper on state contract, and the paper purchaser has agreed to order that kind for the City to try next time paper is ordered.

Refurbished (refilled) toner and ink cartridges were purchased from a local company, Duraline. The water department has already been using the cartridges, but several additional cartridges were purchased for other departments for the trial. The cost is only half of what a new cartridge would cost. The evaluations were good.

The Water and Sewer Department located and purchased recycled carbonless work orders and requisition forms. The evaluations were good.

During the grant project time period a competition was held to redesign the City seal. When the seal was selected the City Clerk ordered new letterhead and matching envelopes. Formerly, the City letterhead was printed on 20% recycled content paper. In order to increase the percentage of recycled content, a 30% recycled paper was located for an acceptable price increase. The evaluations were good.

## **Product evaluation**

The product evaluations were mostly favorable. See attached forms. The form provided by the state seemed overwhelming at first glance, but was used, in-part, by most departments. Some of the products purchased during the grant period were not evaluated for long-term results as the evaluation period was relatively short.

## **Policy development**

The Chatham County Buy-Recycled Policy served as the main resource in drafting the Hendersonville Buy-Recycled Policy. Final adoption of the policy occurred on May 10, 2001 at the May City Council meeting. The main debate in council was whether to have a price cap (10-15% above the cost of the virgin equivalent product) or not.

## **7. Description of any materials developed as a result of the project.**

The flier and agenda for the workshop are included in the attachments. We used the evaluation forms provided by the state. Also see a copy of the approved policy in the attachments.

## Fiscal Report for City of Hendersonville Buy-Recycled project:

### Expenditures:

<u>Office Supplies</u>	<u>recycled content</u>	<u>Recycled product</u>	<u>Charged to grant</u>
1)Great White paper (Office Depot)	30%pc	\$ 492.	\$ 125.
2)Duraline toner & ink cartridges	refilled	\$ 117	\$ 117
3)Recycled Carbonless Work Orders	50% w/20%pc	\$ 980	\$ 170
4)Recycled Carbonless Material Requisition Forms	50% w/20%pc	\$ 151	\$ 8.
5)Royal Fiber City Letterhead	30%pc	\$ 548	\$ 150
6)Matching Envelopes	30%pc	\$ 810	\$ 215

### Automotive Supplies

Safety Kleen America's Choice motor oil	re-refined	Could not get	0
--	------------	---------------	---

### Landscaping Supplies

Hydroseed	recycled newspaper mulch	\$ 596	\$ 275
Permamats Tree Mats	100% tire chips	\$ 20	\$ 20

### Other:

Ladtech Manhole risers	recycled 100% PVC	\$1,473	\$ 270
<b>Total Product Purchases</b>			<b>\$1,350</b>

### Consultant:

Invoice #1 \$ 835			
Invoice #2 \$ 1090			
<b>Total Consultant</b>			<b>\$1,925</b>

### Procurement Team:

<b>City Staff time</b>	<b>\$ 575</b>
<b>Total Grant Expenditures</b>	<b>\$3,850</b>
<b>City cash match</b>	<b>\$ - 350</b>
<b>Grant funds due</b>	<b>\$3,500</b>